Clark County
Historic Preservation Commission
Staff Report

Project Number: PRJ-159984/LUP-69201

Project Name: Clark County Historical Museum (Carnegie Library)

Project Address: 1511 Main Street, Tax Assessor Serial Number 040250-000 located in the NE ¼ of Section 27, Township 2N, Range 1E of the Willamette Meridian

Owner/Applicant: City of Vancouver, PO Box 1995, Vancouver, WA 98668

Application Prepared by: EL, Architects, Eric Lanciautl, 3200 SE 164th Avenue, Suite 302 Vancouver, WA 98683

Staff: Mark Person, Senior Planner

Meeting Date: July 11, 2018

I. SUMMARY
The Clark County Historical Museum is located at 1511 Main Street, Vancouver, WA (Tax Assessor Serial Number 040250-000). The applicant has requested approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the stairs to Main Street. The stairs are in disrepair and are a tripping hazard due to the current arrangement.

The site is within the City of Vancouver.

In accordance with VMC 17.39.080 and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, staff recommends that the Commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness request.

II. CLARK COUNTY HERITAGE REGISTER AND NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES STATUS
The Clark County Historical Museum (Carnegie Library) is on the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) and the Clark County Heritage Register (CCHR).
III. **HISTORIC NAME**
Vancouver City Library (Carnegie Library)

IV. **COMMON NAME**
Clark County Historical Museum

V. **BOARD RESPONSIBILITY**
Under the City of Vancouver Ordinance M-3243 (VMC Chapter 17.39), the Clark County Historic Preservation Commission has the responsibility for reviewing matters of historic preservation within the city of Vancouver.

VI. **STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE**
The building has played an important role in the cultural and intellectual history of the city. The building is a well-preserved example of the libraries built with grants from the great iron and steel magnate, Andrew Carnegie. The library is significant because of its association with Carnegie and with the tradition of philanthropy of which he was the pre-eminent exemplar. The library is also important in the history of the community as a central focus of intellectual and social activity. Finally, the building built in 1909 is an example of a distinct genre of early-twentieth century architecture.

VII. **PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION**
The Clark County Historical Museum is located at 1511 Main Street, Vancouver, WA, at the corner of Main Street and 16th Street. Tax Assessor Serial Number 040250-000 located in the NW ¼ of Section 27, Township 2N, Range 1E of the Willamette Meridian.

VIII. **STAFF REVIEW AND COMMENT**
The design review criteria are listed in the adopted rules and regulations of the Clark County Historic Preservation Commission (April 8, 2008). The standards used are the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation. The standards and findings are listed below.

**Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:**

1. *Every reasonable effort shall be made to provide a compatible use for a property which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure or site and its environment, or to use a property for its originally intended purposes.*

   **Finding:** No change to the property use is proposed. The proposed stair replacement does not significantly alter any environment, site or structure. The proposed alteration will include the removal and replacement of the existing stairs and landings along the west façade of the building, facing Main Street. The light fixtures will be relocated on rebuilt plinths and new handrails and guardrails will be added to meet current accessibility standards.

2. *The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.*
Finding: Removal and replacement of the existing stair is required for safety reasons. Altering the stair is not an option. However, no other defining building feature is being altered. Every effort is being made to only change the stair rise and run and landing depth. The material being used for the stair replacement will be identical to the existing stair. The stair will be slightly longer and the flanking pedestals will be approximately two feet taller.

3. All buildings, structures and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged.

Finding: No alterations that have no historical basis are proposed as part of the stair reconstruction.

4. Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right and this significance shall be recognized and respected.

Finding: No new structures are proposed as part of this proposal.

5. Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, or site shall be treated with sensitivity.

Finding: The stair replacement will exactly reproduce the concrete reveals which create a distinctive feature of the existing stair.

6. Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications or features, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.

Finding: The existing stairs have deteriorated significantly. Past efforts to repair them continue to fail and, over time, future repairs will also fail. These failures pose a safety risk, for example, a recent repair to a step crumbled beneath a footstep. Replacement of the stair will accurately duplicate the existing stairs features.

7. The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials shall not be undertaken.

Finding: The proposal does not include any surface cleaning of the building.
8. *Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by, or adjacent to any project.*

**Finding:** Minimal ground-disturbing actions are proposed with the application. The site is within a Level B area which is a low probability area for discovering archaeological resources. In the event, however, that any item of archaeological interest is uncovered during the course of ground-disturbing action or activity, all ground-disturbing activity shall immediately cease. The applicant shall immediately notify the city planning official and the Office of Archeological and Historic Preservation and have the site assessed by a qualified archaeologist.

9. *Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, materials, and character of the property, neighborhood or environment.*

**Finding:** No alterations or additions are proposed.

10. *Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to structures shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired.*

**Finding:** No additions or alterations to structures are proposed as part of the stair rebuild. The existing stairs will be removed and new stairs are proposed, similar to the existing design with larger landings and handrails to meet current accessibility requirements.

**VII. STAFF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION**

Staff finds the proposal meets the criteria of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and recommends approval of the project as proposed.

**VIII. EXHIBITS**

1. Nomination Form
2. Letter from Nicholas Vann at DAHP dated 6/13/18
3. Applicant submitted exhibits dated 6/20/18

**XI. APPEAL**

The commission’s decision regarding a nomination to the Clark County Heritage Register may be appealed to the City Council. Appeal of the City Council’s decision may be appealed to superior court. The letter of appeal shall state the case number designated by the city and the name of the applicant, name and signature of each petitioner and a statement showing that each petitioner is entitled to file the appeal under VMC Chapter 20, and the specific aspect(s) of the decision and reasons why each aspect is in error as a matter of fact or law, and the evidence relied upon to prove the error.
A fee of $1,763.00 must accompany the appeal. However, if the aggrieved party is a recognized neighborhood association, the fee assessed is $133.00. Submit the appeal request and fee to Development Review Services, either at the Customer Service Counter, first floor of the City Hall, 415 W 6th Street, Vancouver, WA, or to PO Box 1995, Vancouver, WA, 98668-1995.

For more information on the appeal process, please refer to Vancouver Municipal Code 20.210.130 or contact the Community and Economic Development Department, Land Use Team at (360) 487-7803.

Report Prepared by
Mark Person, AICP, Senior Planner

Greg Turner, Manager
Land Use Team

Date
7/3/18

Date
7-3-18
UNIVERSITY OF THE INTERIOR
NATIONAL PARK SERVICE

NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
INVENTORY -- NOMINATION FORM

SEE INSTRUCTIONS IN HOW TO COMPLETE NATIONAL REGISTER FORMS
TYPE ALL ENTRIES -- COMPLETE APPLICABLE SECTIONS

1 NAME

HISTORIC
Vancouver City Library (Carnegie Library)
AND/OR COMMON
Clark County Historical Museum and Library

2 LOCATION

STREET & NUMBER
1511 Main Street
CITY, TOWN
Vancouver
STATE
Washington

3 CLASSIFICATION

CATEGORY

OWNER

PUBLIC
PRIVATE
COMPANY
OWNERSHIP

PUBLIC
PRIVATE
BUILDING(S)
STRUCTURE
SITE
OBJECT

STATUS

IN PROCESS
ACCESSIBLE
YES: UNRESTRICTED
NO

PRESENT USE

AGRICULTURE
COMMERCIAL
EDUCATIONAL
PRIVATE RESIDENCE
WORK IN PROGRESS
MUSEUM & Library
PARK
ENTERTAINMENT
RENOUS:
GOVERNMENT
SCIENTIFIC:
INDUSTRIAL
TRANSPORTATION
MILITARY
OTHER

4 OWNER OF PROPERTY

NAME
City of Vancouver
STREET & NUMBER
210 East 13th Street
CITY, TOWN
Vancouver
STATE
Washington

5 LOCATION OF LEGAL DESCRIPTION

COURTHOUSE, REGISTRY OF DEEDS, ETC.
Clark County Courthouse
STREET & NUMBER
1200 Franklin Street (P.O. Box 500)
CITY, TOWN
Vancouver
STATE
Washington

6 REPRESENTATION IN EXISTING SURVEYS

TITLE
List of Washington historical Buildings
DATE
FEDERAL
STATE
COUNTY
LOCAL

DEPOSITORY FOR SURVEY RECORDS
Wash. State Parks & Recreation Commission - Dr. Stratton
CITY, TOWN
P.O. Box 1128, Olympia, Wa 98504
DESCRIPTION

CONDITION

_ EXCELLENT
X GOOD
 _ FAIR

CHECK ONE

_ DETERIORATED
UNALTERED
ALTERED

CHECK ONE

_ RUINS
_ ORIGINAL SITE
_ UNEXPOSED
MOVING DATE

DESCRIBE THE PRESENT AND ORIGINAL (IF KNOWN) PHYSICAL APPEARANCE

The Clark County Historical Museum and Library is a typical Carnegie library with parapet walls built of solid brick with basement and a main floor. The architects were Dennis Nichols and William Kauffman.

From the Vancouver Columbian of December 31, 1909 (the day of the dedication of the building) the following excerpts were taken:-- "The basement is of concrete and the superstructure of red brick." "Cement steps lead up to the front entrance on either side of which is a pillar. There is a small vestibule and entrance from there into the main library room through a glass door. The eight pillars in the central part of the library building surrounding the librarian's desk give a most imposing appearance to the interior." "In the basement is the boiler room, a large lecture room in which is a moveable platform and what is called the elevator room." (The "elevator" is a lift which is not in use at the present time.) "All the wood in the building is from Clarke County."

Two additions to the building were built in 1944 and 1948.

About 1915 a Camperdown elm was planted in front of the library to the south of the entrance. At the present time the circumference of the tree at the very base is ten feet. The branches cover the entire front of the library.

The original building is 67 feet long, 32 feet wide with the two later additions 37 feet nine inches. The land, the lots donated by Mr. Hidden are 90 by 100 feet.
**STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE**

For Vancouver, a town of nearly 10,000 in 1909, and for Clark County, there was no public library. From the time it was built, this building has played an important role in the lives of the people. In fact, this was the city library until a new one was completed in 1963. The meeting room in the basement was used by many groups.

The influence on the community has continued up to the present time as it now houses the Clark County Historical Museum and its library, the SP & S Railroad Museum and the Clark County Genealogical Society.

Last year the Museum was visited by 13,871 people; of these 5511 were in 178 groups, the majority school classes who were given lectures on the history of the area, pioneer life, etc. by the curators. The children were then taken on tours of the Museum and the artifacts explained to them.

The Museum library contains several thousand books. It is the repository for some rare books, children's old school and story books, books by local authors and poets, a large newspaper collection, journals and ledgers from the courthouse. The most important materials are the histories of Washington and the area, a fairly large collection of maps of the city and county, the picture file, for the use of the curators and for the public to use for research.
9 MAJOR BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES

Clark County Courthouse, 1200 Franklin Street, Vancouver, Washington 98660
Vancouver Independent (Newspaper) 1876-1910
Vancouver Columbian (newspaper) 1899-

10 GEOGRAPHICAL DATA

The Clark County Mapping Service does not have the capabilities to give reference numbers to property corners.

UTM REFERENCES

The Clark County Historical Museum and Library is located at the southeast corner of 16th and Main Streets, lots 2 and 4, Block 67, East Vancouver.
Recorded in the Courthouse under Volume D, page 20.

LIST ALL STATES AND COUNTIES FOR PROPERTIES OVERLAPPING STATE OR COUNTY BOUNDARIES

STATE CODE COUNTY CODE

FORM PREPARED BY

Lesla Scott - Robert Hidden, Chairman Historic Preservation Committee
Committee members - R. Hidden, chairman, Mrs. Dorothy Wendt, Lesla Scott

ORGANIZATION
Port Vancouver Historical Society

STREET & NUMBER
1511 Main Street

CITY OR TOWN
Vancouver

STATE
Wash.

98660

12 STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICER CERTIFICATION

THE EVALUATED SIGNIFICANCE OF THIS PROPERTY WITHIN THE STATE IS:

NATIONAL STATE LOCAL

As the designated State Historic Preservation Officer for the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966 (Public Law 89-665), I hereby nominate this property for inclusion in the National Register and certify that it has been evaluated according to the criteria and procedures set forth by the National Park Service.

FEDERAL REPRESENTATIVE SIGNATURE

TITLE

DATE

DIRECTOR, OFFICE OF ARCHAEOLOGY AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION

DATE

KEEPER OF THE NATIONAL REGISTER
NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
PROPERTY PHOTOGRAPH FORM

1 NAME
HISTORIC
Vancouver City Library (Carnegie Library)
AND/OR COMMON
Clark County Historical Museum and Library

2 LOCATION
CITY, TOWN
Vancouver
VICINITY OF

COUNTY
Clark

STATE
Wash. 98660

3 PHOTO REFERENCE
PHOTO CREDIT
Mrs. Hermine Decker
DATE OF PHOTO

NEGATIVE FILED AT
801 West 45th Street Vancouver, Washington 98660

4 IDENTIFICATION
DESCRIBE VIEW, DIRECTION, ETC. IF DISTRICT, GIVE BUILDING NAME & STREET

PHOTO NO

Standing on MAIN ST.
Look to the EAST AT 1625 ST.
Drawing by Matthew R. Thompson, AIA, of the former Vancouver Public Library showing the architecture and related design, also the Camperdown elm.

Mr. Thompson's address is 110 West 13th Street, Vancouver, Washington 98660.
Camperdown Elm planted about 1915 in front of the former Vancouver Public Library, a Carnegie Library, now the Clark County Historical Museum 1909 Dennis Nichols - Architect

Best Wishes for the Holiday Season
Matthew Ralph Thompson AIA
architecture and related design
1 NAME
   HISTORIC
   Vancouver City Library (Carnegie Library)
   AND/OR COMMON
   Clark County Historical Museum and Library

2 LOCATION
   CITY, TOWN
   Vancouver
   VICINITY OF
   Clark
   COUNTY
   STATE
   Wash.

3 MAP REFERENCE
   SOURCE
   Clark County Courthouse Mapping Service & U.S. G.S.
   SCALE
   1 in. = 200 ft.
   DATE
   April 1, 1977

4 REQUIREMENTS
   TO BE INCLUDED ON ALL MAPS
   1. PROPERTY BOUNDARIES
   2. NORTH ARROW
   3. UTM REFERENCES
   
   Lot 3, Sec 4 of B In 67
   East Vancouver Add. To Vancouver.
UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR
NATIONAL PARK SERVICE
NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
PROPERTY PHOTOGRAPH FORM
(Type all entries - attach to or enclose with photograph)

1. NAME:
   COMMON: Clark County Museum
   AND/OR HISTORIC:
   Carnegie Library

2. LOCATION:
   STREET AND NUMBER: 1515 Main St
   CITY OR TOWN: Vancouver
   STATE: Wash.
   CODE COUNTY: Clark

3. PHOTO REFERENCE:
   PHOTO CREDIT: Kenneth Duthie
   DATE OF PHOTO: July 1973
   NEGATIVE FILED AT: Clark Co. Museum

4. IDENTIFICATION:
   DESCRIBE VIEW, DIRECTION, ETC.
   LOOKING FROM THE NORTH on 16th St.

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR
NATIONAL PARK SERVICE
NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
PROPERTY PHOTOGRAPH FORM
(Type all entries - attach to or enclose with photograph)

1. NAME:
   COMMON: Clark County Museum
   AND/OR HISTORIC:
   Carnegie Library

2. LOCATION:
   STREET AND NUMBER: 1515 Main St
   CITY OR TOWN: Vancouver
   STATE: Wash.
   CODE COUNTY: Clark

3. PHOTO REFERENCE:
   PHOTO CREDIT: Kenneth Duthie
   DATE OF PHOTO: March 1977
   NEGATIVE FILED AT: Clark Co. Museum

4. IDENTIFICATION:
   DESCRIBE VIEW, DIRECTION, ETC.
   Looking from Main St. from the West
   Looking East.
June 13, 2018

Ms. Jan Bader
City of Vancouver - CLG
PO Box 1995
Vancouver, WA 98668-1995

In future correspondence please refer to:
Project Tracking Code: 2018-06-04297
Property: Vancouver Carnegie Library – 1511 Main St, Vancouver
Re: Clark County Historical Museum - front stair

Dear Ms. Bader:

Thank you for contacting the State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO) and Department of Archaeology and Historic Preservation (DAHP) regarding the above referenced proposal. This action has been reviewed on behalf of the SHPO under provisions of Governor’s Executive Order 05-05. Our review is based upon documentation contained in your communication, which only includes information regarding the front stair reconstruction at this time.

It is our opinion that – of the three options presented for review – Option C is the most appropriate solution for resolving the clearance issues at the primary entrance of the Vancouver Carnegie Library, now known as the Clark County Historical Museum. The other options presented, although reversible and leave original historic materials in place, is unlikely to ever be reversed and thus creates a new permanent feature while simultaneously covering up historic materials and design in perpetuity. Option C, however, carries forward the design intent of a grant concrete stair leading to the primary entrance, even though it is reconstructed using new but nearly identical materials. It is thus our opinion that Option C meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and will have no adverse impact on the National Register listed Vancouver Carnegie Library.

This review does not include any comments regarding HVAC rehabilitation, as no information has been presented to date. When new information about affected resources becomes available and/or the project scope of work changes significantly, please resume consultation as our assessment may be revised. Also, if any archaeological resources are uncovered during construction, please halt work immediately in the area of discovery and contact the appropriate Native American Tribes and DAHP for further consultation.

Thank you for the opportunity to review and comment. Should you have any questions, please feel free to contact me.

Sincerely,

Nicholas Vann, AIA
Historical Architect
(360) 586-3079
nicholas.vann@dahp.wa.gov